NOTICE OF TELECONFERENCE
LICENSING & CONTINUING EDUCATION COMMITTEE MEETING
October 6, 2017
11:00 a.m.

One or more Committee Members will participate in this meeting at the teleconference sites listed below. Each teleconference location is accessible to the public and the public will be given an opportunity to address the Licensing, Continuing Education and Public Relations Committee at each teleconference location. The public teleconference sites for this meeting are as follows:

Teleconference Meeting Locations:

901 P Street, Suite 142A
Sacramento, CA 95814
(Board Staff)

Dionne McClain, D.C.
6360 Wilshire Blvd., #410
Los Angeles, CA 90048
(323) 653-1014

Julie Elginer, Dr.PH
29901 Ladyface Circle
Agoura Hills, CA 91301
(818) 889-2278

Heather Dehn, D.C.
4616 El Camino Ave., #B
Sacramento, CA 95821
(916) 488-0202

AGENDA

1. **Call to Order & Establishment of a Quorum**

2. **Approval of May 1, 2017 Committee Meeting Minutes**

3. **Discuss Advancements in Chiropractic Training, Education, and Regulation (Strategic Plan Goal 1.1)**

4. **Review and Discussion on Possible Revisions to Sections 360-366 of Title 16 of the California Code of Regulations Regarding Continuing Education; Possible Recommendation to the Full Board**

5. **Public Comment on Items Not on the Agenda**
   Note: The Committee may not discuss or take action on any matter raised during this public comment section that is not included on this agenda, except to decide whether to place the matter on the agenda of a future meeting. [Government Code Sections 11125, 11125.7(a).] Public comment is encouraged; however, if time constraints mandate, comments may be limited at the discretion of the Chair.

6. **Future Agenda Items**
   Note: The Committee may not discuss or take action on any matter raised during this future agenda Items section that is not included on this agenda, except to decide whether to place the matter on the agenda of a future meeting. [Government Code Sections 11125.]

7. Adjournment

LICENSING & CONTINUING EDUCATION COMMITTEE

Dionne McClain., D.C.
Julie Elginer, Dr. PH
Heather Dehn, D.C.

Meetings of the Board of Chiropractic Examiners' Committee are open to the public except when specifically noticed otherwise in accordance with the Open Meeting Act. Public comments will be taken on agenda items at the time the specific item is raised. The Board's Committee may take action on any item listed on the agenda, unless listed as informational only. All times are approximate and subject to change. Agenda items may be taken out of order to accommodate speakers and to maintain a quorum. The meeting may be cancelled without notice. For verification of the meeting, call (916) 263-5355 or access the Board's Web Site at **www.chiro.ca.gov.**

The meeting facilities are accessible to individuals with physical disabilities. A person who needs a disability-related accommodation or modification to participate in the meeting may make a request by contacting Marlene Valencia at (916) 263-5355 ext. 5329 or e-mail dixie.vanallen@dca.ca.gov or send a written request to the Board of Chiropractic Examiners, 901 P Street, Suite 142A, Sacramento, CA 95814. Providing your request at least five (5) business days before the meeting will help to ensure availability of the requested accommodation.

Board of Chiropractic Examiners
TELECONFERENCE MEETING MINUTES
Licensing, Continuing Education & Public Relations Committee
May 1, 2017
901 P Street, Suite 142A
Sacramento, CA 95814

Teleconference Meeting Locations:

Board of Chiropractic Examiners 901 P Street, Ste 142A Sacramento, CA 95814 (916) 263-5355	Dionne McClain, DC 6360 Wilshire Blvd., Ste 410 Los Angeles, CA 90048 (323) 653-1014	Julie Elginer, Dr. PH Agoura Hills Library 29901 Ladyface Circle Agoura Hills, CA 91301 (818) 889-2278

Committee Members Present
Dionne McClain, D.C., Chair
Julie Elginer, Dr. PH

Staff Present
Robert Puleo, Executive Officer
Dixie Van Allen, Staff Services Manager
Marcus McCarther, Associate Governmental Program Analyst
Brianna Lauziere, Staff Services Analyst

Call to Order
Dr. McClain called the meeting to order at 10:04 a.m.

Roll Call
Dr. McClain called roll. All Committee members were present at the locations specified on the Agenda.

Approval of Minutes

MOTION: DR. MCCLAIN MOVED TO APPROVE THE MINUTES OF THE AUGUST 30, 2016 LICENSING, CONTINUING EDUCATION & PUBLIC RELATIONS COMMITTEE MEETING
SECOND: DR. ELGINER SECONDED THE MOTION
VOTE: 2-0 (DR. MCCLAIN– AYE, DR. ELGINER – AYE)
MOTION CARRIED

Dr Elginer asked the following clarifying questions about the contents of the minutes since she is new to this committee:

- Page 2, paragraph 4 refers to how the Board should qualify chiropractic associations. Is this committee considering establishing criteria for existing chiropractic associations as well as new associations?

  Robert Puleo, Executive Officer, responded that the Committee was not considering establishing qualifications for existing associations, but rather to prevent an individual from forming an association for the sole purpose of being approved as a CE Provider.

  Dixie Van Allen, Licensing Manager, clarified that all providers, regardless of whether they are a school, association or individual, should have to meet the same minimum requirements to be approved as a provider.

  Laurie Isenberg, Life Chiropractic College West, added that she believes only schools and associations should be approved as CE providers.

  Mr. Puleo added that the Board should be careful to not unnecessarily limit competition in providing CE.

  Dr. McClain added that the Arizona CE regulations are just a model to use as a starting place which the Board can use to build upon.

- Dr. Elginer inquired about whether the spreadsheet enumerating CE hours taught by providers (referenced on page 3, paragraph 8 of the minutes) was available and requested that this be shared with the Licensing Committee at each committee meeting.

  Ms. Van Allen replied that the spreadsheet is available to share with the committee.

Review and Discussion on the 2017-19 BCE Strategic Plan Action Items for Licensing Committee

<u>Goal 1.1</u>

Dr. McClain inquired about the status of Action Item 1.1.3.

Ms. Van Allen clarified that this action item is not completed. The Board plans to invite a CCE representative to participate on a conference call during a Licensing/CE Committee meeting to determine if it is feasible to raise the entrance requirements (i.e. Bachelor's Degree, GPA) for the chiropractic profession.

Dr. Elginer expressed concern, on behalf of the public, with the fact that a medical provider who uses the title of "Dr." is not required to have a Bachelor's Degree, and believes that changing this entrance requirement would be an important step in moving the profession forward.

Mr. Puleo mentioned that this is a topic that should be discussed at the national level because

it will impact all chiropractic schools, states and students.

Dr. Elginer requested additional status boxes be added to each goal in the strategic plan titled "completion date" and "target date".

Goal 1.2

Dr. McClain inquired about the completion date listed.

Mr. Puleo clarified that this goal was a carryover from the previous strategic plan. Action Item 1.2.1 was completed and he will work with staff to adjust the dates on the other action items.

Goal 1.3

Dr. McClain suggested amending the dates of these action items.

Mr. Puleo explained that current CE regulations do not contain many specific requirements for providers; therefore, the Board doesn't have much enforcement authority for auditing CE courses.

Dr. Elginer explained that this goal is related to goal 1.2 and will be part of the overhaul of CE regulations.

Goal 1.4

Mr. Puleo explained that the Board is currently working on this goal. Staff has met with OIS to discuss their IT needs. The Board will be working with SOLID to do process mapping, which is a legislative mandate for all state entities prior to entering into any new IT contract.

Dr. McClain inquired about a projected completion date.

Mr. Puleo advised that this Board is next in line for SOLID's process mapping services and hopes that the Board will be able to transition to a new IT system at the beginning of next year. The Board should be able to accept online renewals in the near future.

Ms. Isenberg inquired about the ability to use credit cards to pay for other things.

Mr. Puleo explained that initially, the Board will only have the ability to accept online payments for license renewals.

Goal 1.5

There was no update for this goal.

Goal 1.6

Mr. Puleo added that the Board would amend the CE regulations to require this course, but providers would need to develop the course.

Ms. Van Allen stated that the Top 10 List of Violations are currently being mailed to CE providers whose Ethics and Law courses are approved by the Board and encouraged to distribute the information to their attendees.

Ms. Isenberg stated that Life Chiropractic College West distributes the Board's Top 10 Violations list at all their CE courses.

Dr. McClain agreed that this information should be shared at all BCE approved CE courses.

Gillian Hacker, CCA added that there will be a booth available at their conference for the Board to use for distribution of materials.

Goal 1.7

Dr. Elginer believes this item is outside the scope of this committee and recommended that this item be brought back to the Board for reassignment.

Mr. Puleo agreed and recommended that this goal be moved to the Executive Committee

Review and Discussion on Possible Revisions to Sections 360-366 of Title 16 of the California Code of Regulations Regarding Continuing Education; Possible Recommendation to Full Board

Mr. Puleo clarified that with the reassignment of Committee Members, this Committee will be looking at this topic from a different perspective by reviewing Arizona's CE regulations, which is viewed by its stakeholders as a reputable and streamlined model.

Dr. Elginer suggested drafting a memo for the next Board meeting, instructing the Board Members to review the Arizona CE model and share their feedback on using this model as a starting point for drafting new CE language.

Ms. Isenberg shared that the Arizona model is an excellent example of assuring academic quality; however, the course approval process is laborious and may be cost prohibitive for providers. The requirements for letters of recommendation and license verification are cumbersome. Further, online CE courses are only allowed to be provided by colleges, but the technology required is advanced and beyond the capability of her college. This may be a barrier for providers. Lastly, the Arizona model prohibits the use of adjunct faculty members.

Public Comment
No public comment.

Future Agenda Items
None

Adjournment
Dr. McClain adjourned the meeting at 11:24 a.m.

DRAFT

Licensing and Professional Qualification

Ensure the continuous competency of all Doctors of Chiropractic by promoting licensing standards, professional conduct, and requirements for continuing education.

1.1

Interface with the Council on Chiropractic Education (CCE) to explore the possibility of revising entrance requirements at chiropractic colleges to enhance the quality and caliber of graduates.

Objective Measurement	
Made determination of the path to take.	
Action Item	**Carry-Over Item**
1.1.1 Discuss objective scope with Licensing Committee at next meeting.	2014*
1.1.2 Invite CCE representative to participate in a Licensing Committee meeting to discuss possibility of enhancing entrance requirement.	2014*
1.1.3 Depending on results of CCE meeting, partner with SOLID to possibly convene a task force to discuss entrance requirements (Federation of Chiropractic Licensing Boards [FCLB], CCE, California Chiropractic Association [CCA], American Chiropractic Association [ACA]).	2014*
1.1.4 Determine if there is data to share with Board regarding national discussion.	2014*

*Action items from BCE's *2014–2017 Strategic Plan.*

CCE®
THE COUNCIL ON CHIROPRACTIC EDUCATION

California State Board of Chiropractic Examiners

October 6, 2017, Presentation

Accreditation & Regulation

Role of Accreditation

CCE's Vision

Promoting Excellence and Assuring Quality in Chiropractic Education

Leadership so the Public, the Government, and the Profession value chiropractic education.

Purpose of Accreditation

CCE's Mission

To assure the quality and integrity of its accredited doctor of chiropractic degree and residency programs.

The purpose of accreditation is to provide assurance of quality and integrity to stakeholders including national governments, **state licensing authorities**, trade organizations, other academic institutions, other accrediting agencies, students, and the public

("The Postsecondary", 2016)

Values

The Council on Chiropractic Education is recognized by the United States Department of Education and the Council for Higher Education Accreditation as the accrediting body for chiropractic programs. In fulfilling its Mission and the requirements of these oversight agencies, the CCE is committed to the following values:

- Integrity as the foundation in all interactions
- Accountability to students and the public
- Collaboration in community of people with a culture of respect
- Quality as informed by the use of evidence
- Improvement to advance excellence

Providing Leadership so the Public, our Government and our Profession value chiropractic education

Recognized by the United States Department of Education (USDE)

Recognized by the Council for Higher Education Accreditation (CHEA)

One of only 15 agencies (out of 78) to be recognized by both

LCME, AOACOCA, ARCEPA not recognized by both; NANP not recognized by either.

Malcom Baldrige National Quality Awards Program Recipient

Arizona Performance Excellence Program Award for Site Team Academy Development

Member of the Assn of Specialized and Professional Accreditors (ASPA)

CCE **endorses and complies** with the **ASPA *Code of Good Practice***

CCE THE COUNCIL ON CHIROPRACTIC EDUCATION

Council on Chiropractic Education (CCE)®

Rigor of CCE Processes

CCE Vision Context

Promoting through the accreditation process, excellence in chiropractic education and the safe and effective delivery of quality health care to patients

The CCE is focused on **student success** and **protection of the public**:

- Students intellectual, personal, and employment success
- The public deserves access to safe, effective, and ethical doctors of chiropractic

High expectations for DC education programs:

- Clearly defined
- Understood
- Shared.

Rigor of CCE Processes

CCE Clinical Education Meta-Competencies

A graduate of a CCE accredited DCP is competent in the areas of:

META-COMPETENCY 1 - ASSESSMENT & DIAGNOSIS
META-COMPETENCY 2 - MANAGEMENT PLAN
META-COMPETENCY 3 - HEALTH PROMOTION AND DISEASE PREVENTION
META-COMPETENCY 4 - COMMUNICATION AND RECORD KEEPING
META-COMPETENCY 5 - PROFESSIONAL ETHICS AND JURISPRUDENCE
META-COMPETENCY 6 - INFORMATION AND TECHNOLOGY LITERACY
META-COMPETENCY 7 - CHIROPRACTIC ADJUSTMENT/MANIPULATION
META-COMPETENCY 8 - INTER-PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION

META-COMPETENCY 7 – CHIROPRACTIC ADJUSTMENT/MANIPULATION (New-2018)

Doctors of chiropractic employ the adjustment/manipulation to address joint and neurophysiologic dysfunction. The adjustment/manipulation is a precise procedure requiring the discrimination and identification of dysfunction, interpretation and application of clinical knowledge; and, the use of cognitive and psychomotor skills.

CURRICULAR OBJECTIVE:
The program prepares students to –

A. Assess normal and abnormal structural, neurological and functional articular relationships.

B. Evaluate the clinical indications and rationale for selecting a particular chiropractic adjustment/manipulation.

C. Determine, based on clinical indications and risk factors, the appropriateness of delivering chiropractic adjustment/manipulation.

D. Demonstrate the knowledge, mechanical principles, and psychomotor skills necessary to safely perform chiropractic adjustment/manipulation.

E. Assess the patient outcome(s) of the chiropractic adjustment/manipulation.

OUTCOMES:
Students will be able to -

1) Employ methods to identify subluxations/segmental dysfunction of the spine and/or other articulations.

2) Analyze and interpret findings indicating the need for chiropractic adjustment/manipulation.

3) Identify indications, contraindications, and risk factors for the chiropractic adjustment/manipulation; and, explain the anticipated benefits, potential complications and effects(s) to patients.

4) Apply chiropractic adjustment/manipulation to patients while ensuring patient safety.

5) Employ methods for identifying and documenting the effects following the chiropractic adjustment/manipulation.

META-COMPETENCY 8 – INTERPROFESSIONAL EDUCATION (New-2018)

Students have the knowledge, skills and values necessary to function as part of an inter-professional team to provide patient-centered collaborative care. Inter-professional teamwork may be demonstrated in didactic, clinical or simulated learning environments.

CURRICULAR OBJECTIVE:
The program prepares students to –

A. Work with other health professionals to maintain a climate of mutual respect and shared values, placing the interests of patients at the center of inter-professional health care delivery.

B. Use the knowledge of one's own role and of other professions' roles to effectively interact with team members.

C. Understand different models of inter-professional care, organizational and administrative structures, and the decision-making processes that accompany them.

D. Understand the principles of team dynamics to perform effectively on an inter-professional team influencing patient centered care that is safe, timely, efficient, effective and equitable.

E. Organize and communicate with patients, families, and healthcare team members to ensure common understanding of information, treatment and care decisions.

OUTCOMES:
Students will be able to -

1) Explain their own roles and responsibilities and those of other care providers and how the team works together to provide care.

2) Use appropriate team building and collaborative strategies with other members of the healthcare team to support a team approach to patient centered care.

Accreditation & Regulation: Role in Patient Safety

Deciding on the minimum level of quality

- Best programs and procedures
- How to assess & monitor success or failure
- How quickly to raise Standards

Accreditation:

- Observed to be more effective in Good Safety practices
- Best practice of creating ***ACCOUNTABLE*** and ***MEASURABLE*** Standards/Outcomes

FCLB's Most Recent Concerns & Suggestions for CCE Standards:

- Adding nomenclature for "laws" &"patient information" to Ethics & Integrity
  - ***Completed***, *in Draft considered by the Council in January, 2016*
- Adding nomenclature for informing students on legal requirements to practice in their intended state
  - ***Completed***, *in Draft considered by the Council in January, 2016*
- Change nomenclature regarding comparable to either similar or consistent
  - **Completed,** in Draft 3 by SRTF and Council in July, 2016
- Considered 15 suggestions for changes to nomenclature in meta-competencies
  - **Completed,**in Draft 3 by ACC Accreditation and Assessment workgroup to be considered by SRTF and Council in July, 2016

Chiropractic Student Admissions

- **Must** complete the equivalent of three academic years of undergraduate study (**90 semester hours**)
- The GPA for these 90 semester hours is **not less than 3.0 on a 4.0 scale**
- The 90 semester hours will include a **minimum of 24** semester hours in life and physical science courses
  - At least half of these courses will have a substantive laboratory component.
- The student's undergraduate preparation also includes a well-rounded general education program in the humanities and social sciences

Chiropractic Student Admissions

- A DCP may admit students who do not meet the requirements stated above under the **terms and conditions** of CCE Policy 7.
  - Alternative criteria and processes used to determine acceptance of AATP students, including rationales for establishing such criteria and delineation of the role of the faculty members in the process.
  - **No student is to be admitted who has completed fewer** than 90 semester hours and/or has a GPA for these 90 hours of less than 2.75/4.0.
  - **Academic support services** to optimize the ability of AATP students to succeed in the program, e.g., transitional studies, tutorials, academic advising, and study strategies.
  - Policies and procedures that dictate **active interventions** based upon student needs.

Dental Admission Standards

Admission policies and procedures must be designed to include recruitment and admission of a diverse student population.

Medical School Admission Standards

A broad undergraduate education that includes the study of the humanities, natural sciences, and social sciences, and confines its specific premedical course requirements to those deemed essential preparation for successful completion of its medical curriculum.

Council on Chiropractic Education (CCE)®

Osteopathic Admission Standards

A COM must establish and publish, to the public, admission requirements for potential applicants to the osteopathic medical education program and must use effective policies and procedures for osteopathic medical student selection for admission and enrollment, including technical standards for admissions.

A COM must tie all admissions policies to the COM mission.

Podiatry Admission Standards

The college publishes admission policies that are designed to secure the most qualified students.

Council on Chiropractic Education (CCE)®

Admission Standards

Predicting success in graduate entry medical students undertaking a graduate entry medical program

THEA HALDANE, MANJEET SHEHMAR , COLIN FRANCIS MACDOUGALL, ALEC PRICE-FORBES, IAN FRASER , STUART PETERSEN & ED PEILE

- Good performance in a first degree is sufficient to select for success in medicine irrespective of grades achieved.
- Academic achievement at the end of school does not predict clinical performance.
- Those who excel at school also seem to excel at written assessments at medical school.
- Students' age does not influence performance in graduate medical school.

Accountability

- CCE-US undergoes a rigorous examination:
  - National Advisory Committee on Institutional Quality and Integrity (NACIQI)
  - Council on Higher Education Accreditation
- CCE is examined by independent USDE and CHEA examiners:
  - At its decision making meetings
  - During site team evaluation visits to programs
- The CCE must demonstrate comprehensive educational program competencies:
  - Specifically **measuring** and **assessing** success with respect to student achievement.

Accountability

- A primary interest of CCE-US is **to ensure** that a program accredited is:
  - in accordance with entrance requirements, curricula, services, and conditions that are applied appropriately and consistently.
- The Standards are drafted through a process that considers the **requirements** of:
  - Jurisdictional licensing authorities
  - The United States Department of Education
  - The Council on Higher Education Accreditation

Questions…

Contact Information

Craig S. Little, D.C., M.Ed
President/CEO
The Council on Chiropractic Education
8049 N 85th Way
Scotsdale, AZ 85258
Phone: 480-443-8877
www.cce-usa.org
little@cce-usa.org

CCE THE COUNCIL ON CHIROPRACTIC EDUCATION

Council on Chiropractic Education (CCE)®

AMERICAN CHIROPRACTIC ASSOCIATION

1701 Clarendon Blvd
Suite 200
Arlington, VA 22209

TEL 703 276 8800
FAX 703 243 2593
WEB acatoday.org

October 3, 2017

Mr. Robert Puleo
Executive Officer
California Board of Chiropractic Examiners
901 P Street, Suite 142A
Sacramento, California 95814

Dear Mr. Puleo,

The American Chiropractic Association (ACA) is the largest organization in the United States representing doctors of chiropractic. ACA is leading our profession in the most constructive and far-reaching ways – by working hand in hand with other health care professionals, by supporting meaningful research, and by using that research to inform chiropractic practice. ACA members pledge to adhere to the highest standards of ethics and patient care, contributing to the health and well-being of the estimated 33 million individuals across the United States who seek chiropractic care each year. ACA appreciates the opportunity to provide comments regarding the California Board of Chiropractic Examiners Licensing & Continuing Education (CE) Committee's review of existing curriculum and mandatory CE requirements.

ACA strongly urges the California Board of Chiropractic Examiners to accept the current standards set forth by the Council on Chiropractic Education (CCE) as the primary criteria for licensure. CCE is the organization designated by the federal Department of Education (DoEd) for accrediting all colleges and universities in the United States that bestow doctor of chiropractic degrees. ACA is well informed about CCE's processes and the positive results of its work throughout the country. In the past, ACA has worked with CCE to ensure that they recognize and rectify the standards prescribed by DoEd. We also have other channels of observing the positive results of CCE's programs. For example, many ACA volunteer leaders serve, or have previously served, as CCE committee members. As alumni, many ACA volunteer leaders serve on boards and committees of chiropractic colleges, and many of our members serve as instructors at these colleges.

ACA supports the effects of comprehensive, quality state licensure on public welfare and patient safety. All states and territories accept the authority of CCE in this area. It is a fundamental licensing requirement of 45 states that qualified applicants must have earned their DC degree from a chiropractic college accredited by the CCE. Therefore, in the interest of continuing this vital public safeguard, ACA recommends that the California Board of Chiropractic Examiners recognize CCE's current standards and, at the same time, avoid any extraneous requirements for licensure in the state.

ACA sincerely appreciates the opportunity to provide comments to the Board and we are happy to provide you with any further information going forward. If you should have any questions, please feel free to contact John Falardeau, Senior Vice President, Public Policy and Advocacy at (703) 812-0214 or at jfalardeau@acatoday.org. Thank you.

Respectfully,

David A. Herd, D.C.
President